General Convention of The Episcopal Church 2022 Archives' Research Report

Resolution No.: 2022-D097

Title: Resolution Concerning the Episcopal Election of the Rev. Charlie Holt

Proposer: Dr. Adam Hamilton-Ferguson

Topic: Appointments/Elections

Directly Related: (Attached)

None

Indirectly Related: (Available in the Acts of Convention database, searchable by resolution number)

None

In preparing this report, the Archives researched the resolutions in the Acts of Convention database for the period 1973 through 2018, selecting "direct" resolutions that have a substantive bearing on the proposed legislation. The "direct" resolutions are attached and "indirect" resolutions are available in the Acts of Convention database. Committee members who require other research assistance should contact the Archives through the <u>Research Request Form</u> or call 800-525-9329.

D097 - Resolution Concerning the Episcopal Election of the Rev. Charlie Holt

Final Status: Not Yet Finalized

Proposed by: Dr. Adam Hamilton-Ferguson **Endorsed by:** Mr. Joe McDaniel,Mr. Jon Rania

Requests New Interim Body: No Amends C&C or Rules of Order: No

Has Budget Implications: No

Cost: HiA: HB

Legislative Committee Currently Assigned: 15 - Ministry

Completion Status: Incomplete Latest House Action: N/A Supporting Documents: No

					_	-
$\mathbf{\nu}$	00	\sim		ion	$-$ 1 α	vt
\mathbf{r}	E 3	v	uu	wi		ΛL

Resolved, the House of	concurring
resolved, the nouse of	concurring,

That the 80th General Convention of the Episcopal Church asks all diocesan standing committees to prayerfully pause, reflect, and review all available letters by those concerned and the writing and video responses of the Rev. Charlie Holt made available in the public domain; and be it further

Resolved, that the 80th General Convention of the Episcopal Church expresses concern over the disputed election practices for the episcopal election in the Diocese of Florida specifically the disparity between accommodations made for clergy delegates to participate in remote voting that were not made for lay delegates who were required to vote in person only; and be it further

Resolved, that the 80th General Convention of the Episcopal Church expresses concern that the laity were not given equal place in the governance of the church concerning accommodations that were given to the clergy only; and be it further

Resolved, that the 80th General Convention of the Episcopal Church finds the Rev. Charlie Holt's public writings and comments concerning race incompatible with the teaching on racism of the Episcopal Church.

Explanation

The Diocese of Florida has elected the Rev. Charlie Holt as its Bishop Coadjutor Elect. There has been an objection filed regarding the validity of the episcopal election.

https://www.episcopalnewsservice.org/2022/06/03/presiding-bishop-receives-objection-to-florida-bishop-coadjutor-election-planned-consecration-delayed/

An Outline of the Faith, commonly called the Catechism shows and states that a lay person, by virtue of being a lay person has an equal place as a minister of the Church and takes their place in the life, worship, and governance of the Church:

The ministers of the Church are lay persons, bishops, priests, and deacons.

The ministry of lay persons is to represent Christ and his Church; to bear witness to him wherever they may be; and, according to the gifts given them, to carry on Christ's work of reconciliation in the world; and to take their place in the life, worship, and governance of the Church.

Many people and church affiliated organizations have expressed concerns regarding the suitability of the Rev. Charlie Holt to be a bishop in the Episcopal Church based on his writing and comments on LGBTQI+ issues and race.

https://www.episcopalnewsservice.org/2022/05/26/florida-bishop-coadjutor-election-challenged-with-formal-objection-effort-to-deny-consent/

Responses to questions posed on race can to the Rev. Holt can be viewed here:

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=l DuqoWOxDE

Archived versions of the Rev. Charlie Holt's writings:

http://web.archive.org/web/20160403190102/http://revcharlieholt.com/the-banner-of-christ-alone/

http://web.archive.org/web/20160702132245/http://revcharlieholt.com/the-banner-of-christ-alone-2/

http://web.archive.org/web/20160403190057/http://revcharlieholt.com/the-banner-of-christ-alone-3/

These writings published online have since been edited but the versions listed above were cached as current as of April 24, 2022, by Google. In the archived versions of the Rev. Holt's three part "The Banner of Christ Alone" series he both renounces the Confederate flag while simultaneous building up an argument that upholding one's racial identity is morally equivalent and synonymous with defending the Confederate flag. The Rev. Holt compares his conversion away from supporting the Confederate flag as a "loss" and builds up an argument that ethnic minorities must equally give up their racial identity to be conformed to Christ.

The archived version of Part 1 of the "The Banner of Christ Alone," contains the following:

The Rev. Holt writes "Some of the national debate which has ensued following the shooting of nine Christians in Charleston revolves around whether to furl the Confederate flag, as it is now being used as a banner under which many of the white supremacist groups fly. I want to add to some of the thoughts on heritage and the banners under which we fly, but from a different angle. I believe that flags, badges and symbols of our heritage matter, but they should not be our primary and defining identity any longer as Christians. And neither should the color of our skin for that matter.

The archived version of Part 2 of "The Banner of Christ Alone" contains the following:

In reference to gatherings of clergy in the wake of the Trayvon Martin shooting, the Rev. Holt laments, "While the larger integrated group meetings were happening, it came to our attention that the African-American Ministerial Association was also meeting apart from our larger meetings to strategize and talk. (BTW, there is not a White Ministerial Association.)"

In his comparison of Black pastors to dwarves he applied a quote from CS Lewis, "...They have chosen cunning instead of belief. Their prison is only in their minds, yet they are in that prison; and so afraid of being taken in that they cannot be taken out."

The Rev. Holt describes the lived experience of the communities as "racially-biased grids of hurt and betrayal" and asks the reader, "While I think it is healthy to vocalize that mistrust, I personally am asking for it to be surrendered at the cross as well, especially among us who wear the yoke of Christ as pastors and church leaders. It does not further the Kingdom of God for us to take offense at one another."

He goes on to compare Black pastors to supporters of the Confederate Flag, "The defensiveness I am hearing from some Southerners about the Confederate flag has that same sound of the refrain of the dwarves to me,..."

The archived version of Part 3 of the "Banner of Christ alone" continues to compare Black identity to support for the Confederate flag:

The Rev. Holt opens this section, "The vision of the New Humanity voiced in the New Covenant does indeed express a vision that includes people from every tribe and nation. Praise God for that! It also is a call to be willing to die to those cultural and genetic identities along with all of their badges and symbols."

Referencing back to Part 1, the Rev. Holt closes with a personal anecdote, "You ask me to set aside my white Southern family heritage for your sake and for the sake of Christ. I tell you that I am willing to do it and that I have done it with loss."

References to the Church's teaching on racism can be found:

Canon III.8.5.h.4, training for priests, lists "the Church's teaching on racism."

Canon III.6.5.g.4, training for deacons, lists "the Church's teaching on racism."

Canon III.10.1.c.4, evidence of training for reception of clergy from other Churches, lists "the Church's teaching on racism."

Canon III.12.5.viii.4, training for a Bishop, lists "the Church's teaching on racism."